Load Rating Concrete Arch Bridges with Graphic Statics





William Vermes August 24, 2017

## The References

#### OhioLINK: Keyword "Graphic Statics" produces 72 individual books.



# The Disclaimer

It is hoped that the practising engineer, who ha	is, as a
rule, little time to study mathematical demonstrations	<u>sorto</u>
search through several pages of transformations for a	desired
formula, will appreciate the collection in simple form (C	Chapter
II) of all of the necessary formulas likely to be ne	These summation formulas are readily applied in the design-
practice, and also the ease and celerity with whi	ing of masonry arches.
can be applied, with the aid of the tables, to the case	Nearly all of the formulas given have been deduced for
A fair trial of the summation formulas given in t	this treatise by two radically different methods. Many of
chapter will, it is believed, lead to the adoption c	these formulas are old, and while it was desired to give full
	credit in every particular, it was not found either expedient or
	possible to do so for each form.
	The tables were carefully computed, and when possible
	by the method of differences, each tenth value being checked
Lessons from	The demonstrations are believed to be sufficiently size al.
our Engineering	to be easily followed by senior students in Technical schools
our Engineering	With the aid of the tables, class problems can be solved
Forefathers.	which otherwise would be impossible on account of the time
	required where direct computation of the various terms must
	be resorted to.
	The author will esteem it a favor if any errors that may
	be found are at once brought to his notice.

### The Fredericktown Arch: How?

50-ft. Melan concrete arch Built 1896 2<sup>ND</sup> oldest concrete arch in Ohio Among first 20 built in U.S.



# The Fredericktown Arch: How?





- Load rating: Engineering Judgment.
- <u>3 Ton</u> load posting.
- Local farmer says a fully loaded fertilizer truck crossed it.

### **Answer: Graphic Statics**



#### **Graphic Statics**

1840 to 1940:





Today:

# **Graphic Statics**

	-	
MENTER CLUI UNE UTUS US LE CE USER COVER COVER USUA UNU UNUE CAUN UN	Unding Und UN UN UN UN UN UN UN UN Late Lite Late Late Late LALE LALE	
B.L. 0 + 4.73 + 845 + 1/80 + 930 + 647 + 345 + /25 + 63 + 63 + 178 + 493 + 74	1 + 1050 + 1310 + 940 + 440 0 - 450 - 868 - 1255 -1180 - 1275 - 975	
LL(Mm) 0 0 0 0 - 270 - 400 - 910 - 1160 - 1260 - 160 - 914 - 6		
MIN - /6+ - 668 - 1072 - 1215 - 1215 - 644	- 74 - 74 - 774 - 775	
Section water a way and a to be a to be a to be and the set of the	2014 5 2016 2016 2016 2016 2016 2016 2016 2016	
	aranegarmez areas	
A 100 JTLIS 25 400 25 4	25000 25 000 75 000 25000 21000 21000 2100 210000 2100000 2100000 210000 21000 21000 210000 210000 210000 210000 210000 210000 210000 210000 210000 2100000000	
NETURE ATTA 31.4 31.4 642 868 806 726 695 635 635 646 746 81	877 958 697 154 286 337 634 90.1 878 863 447	
WEIGHT 1		
NEWBER 1210, W.	Walle Walle De Waltin Vola La La La La Late Late Late Late Late L	
leners i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i		
L. (ALC) / 0 + 9 + 17 + 240 + 290 + 350 + 420 + 480 + 500 + 500 + 410 + 450 + 34	+ JEO + 264 + 124 + 104 + JA 94 - 184 - 250 - 240 - 250 - 310	
1.1 (NW) - 0 0 0 0 - 100 - 230 - 350 - 450 - 470 - 490 - 450 - 350 - 23 MAX 0 + 550 +1020 + 1570 + 1290 + 1020 + 790 + 615 + 568 + 568 + 682 + 920 4/17	-104 0 0 0 - 30 0 0 4 0 0 + 110 +1450 +1670 + 1190 + 625 + 30 - 573 -1115 -1600 -1510 - 1625 -1360	
MIN. /	- 30	
Secriba setter grand licens while a set while the set price proves which and a setter and a set	the start water and start and start and start and start and start and start	
MINTATERS 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 2500 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25000 25	25000 25000 25000 26000 27000 27000 27000 27000 27000 27000 27000	
Krinal Area 284 29.4 32.4 72.8 61.7 49.7 57.4 29.4 29.4 12.4 44.7 57.4	674 788 542 274 284 337 587 784 74/ 784 67.7	40
NEISIF 01: 110 172 104 110 41 80 18 18 102 174 WEIGHT	134. 118 128 10 54-40 78-72 124-102 48 104 88	
	CRADE 1663 of UR	
	yand jour	
		THE NEW YORK AND AND A MANY AND
	re A A A A A	
		STRESS DIAGRAM FOR LL ON RIGHT CANTILEYER
	TRESS DIAGRAM FOR LL OH LEFT GINTILEVER SALE 1" 274,000 "	STRESS DIAGRAM FOR LL, ON CENTER SPAN
	i <b>s</b>	STALE 1 = 276,000 * OUTSIDE TRUSS CL. STRESS = 3 INSIDE TRUSS
	Un lig Lights Vistor the Las Vistor Unter Vistor Vistor	Mamoral Under Under Under Under Under Under Usder Usters Under Uster Uster Under Uster Under Under Under Under
	- 635 - 355 + 795 - 890 + 805 - 825 + 775 - 710 .	01347 + \$15 - 5'15 + 5\$40 - 616 + 572 670 + 583 - 680 - 920 + 855 - 983 + 865 - 24 - (1447)
		$H = \frac{1}{2L(Mm)} + \frac{1}{20} + \frac$
	122/15 2020 1 20	7
	At 1168 At 114 & Store & Store & Att is a far for a far for the	SECTION 1444 4444 4444 4444 Level Level start war lover lo
	56.5 613 452 635 462 59.7 477 375 . (4.3 677 524 625 462 59.7 677 576	TI TI COMPACT 21000 CONDUCTORDO 125 00017/1000 025000 7100012/00000000
	1/33 152 124 144 136 134 126 116	
		TECSS DIAGON FOR DI ON TASION TOUSS

#### **Graphic Statics**



### **Concrete Arch Design**

**Recently discovered 1890s concrete arch design sheet** (Cleveland Public Library)











#### Arch Design







#### Scale and Load Cases

#### Force Polygons, 1= 10,000. A 30° decrease in Temp. Full D.+L. B " " " " " " " C Full D.and L. D 15° increase in Temp Full D.+L. E % Span D.and L. F 15° increase in Tamp. % D.+L.

# Arch Design Live Loads

#### Various Loads for Vehicular Bridges

- 100 PSF common
- Highest found: 312 PSF
- Common Vehicle through 1910s: 11 Ton road grader

#### **Arch Live Loads Placements**





### **Graphic Statics Analysis**







# **Graphic Statics Analysis**



# The Decline of Graphic Statics

#### **Graphic Statics**

#### Contemporary Statics & FEM

Has inexactness

- Very precise
- Needs drafting tables,
  papers and pencils
- Determines
  equilibrium

- Ease with slide rules, calculators and computers
- Based on material properties

# Graphic Statics Load Rating: The Ground Rules

Compare rating factors with previous FEM arch load ratings:

- 1. Use same material strengths
- 2. Investigate controlling OLL vehicle and placement on arch.
- 3. Use LFR load rating methods.

### **Eden Park Arch**



- Cincinnati
- Built 1894-95
- 70-ft. span



# North Quarry Lane Arch



- Cuyahoga County
- 150 ft. span
- Built 1938

### North Quarry Lane Arch

Pt.	DL Vert. (k)	DL Hor. (k)	LL (k)	DL + LL Vert. (k)	Pt.
10	5.95	2.92	0.00	5.95	1
9	10.73	4.71	0.00	10.73	2
8	9.14	3.22	0.00	9.14	3
7	7.50	2.14	0.00	7.50	4
6	6.00	1.51	0.00	6.00	5
5	4.69	1.12	0.00	4.69	6
4	3.70	0.77	0.00	3.70	7
3	3.02	0.51	0.00	3.02	8
2	2.53	0.33	0.21	2.74	9
1	2.18	0.20	1.56	3.74	10
0	1.99	0.00	2.25	4.24	11
1	2.10	-0.20	1.81	3.91	12
2	2.39	-0.32	0.25	2.64	13
3	2.84	-0.50	0.00	2.84	14
4	3.47	-0.75	0.00	3.47	15
5	4.41	-1.10	0.00	4.41	16
6	5.66	-1.48	0.00	5.66	17
7	7.16	-2.19	0.00	7.16	18
8	8.94	-3.25	0.00	8.94	19
9	10.66	-4.50	0.00	10.66	20
10	5.93	-2.72	0.00	5.93	21

ΣLL =



ΣDL = 110.99 k

ΣDL & LL = 117.07 k

6.08 k

#### **Berea Arch**

Pt.	DL Vert. (k)	DL Hor. (k)	LL (k)	DL + LL Vert. (k)	Pt.
10	5.95	2.92	0.00	5.95	1
9	10.73	4.71	0.00	10.73	2
8	9.14	3.22	0.00	9.14	3
7	7.50	2.14	0.00	7.50	4
6	6.00	1.51	0.00	6.00	5
5	4.69	1.12	0.00	4.69	6
4	3.70	0.77	0.00	3.70	7
3	3.02	0.51	0.00	3.02	8
2	2.53	0.33	0.21	2.74	9
1	2.18	0.20	1.56	3.74	10
0	1.99	0.00	2.25	4.24	11
1	2.10	-0.20	1.81	3.91	12
2	2.39	-0.32	0.25	2.64	13
3	2.84	-0.50	0.00	2.84	14
4	3.47	-0.75	0.00	3.47	15
5	4.41	-1.10	0.00	4.41	16
6	5.66	-1.48	0.00	5.66	17
7	7.16	-2.19	0.00	7.16	18
8	8.94	-3.25	0.00	8.94	19
9	10.66	-4.50	0.00	10.66	20
10	5.93	-2.72	0.00	5.93	21

ΣLL =



ΣDL = 110.99 k

ΣDL&LL = 117.07 k

6.08 k

DL

DL + LL

# Load Rating Variance



# Load Rating Variance

ltem	Rating Factors		
	Eden Park	N. Quarry Lane	
Controlling Vehicle	4F1	3F1	
Location	Crown	Crown	
FEM Rating Factor	4.70	2.75	
Graphic Statics Methods <sup>*</sup>	~ 3.0 to 6.0	~ 2.0 to 4.0	

\* Graphic Statics still inexact

# Load Rating Variance





#### The Strength of Graphic Statics: Has a feel like driving a car with a manual transmission!

- No black box, the engineer can "see" the structure work.
- Easy to follow the process and find issues or errors.



1. The Past: Can be a great learning tool for engineering students.

Taught by Dr. Boothby, Penn State Architectural Engineering program.

Developing workshop for U. of Akron Civil Engineering, Spring 2018



2. The Present: Graphic statics may be easier to use now with CAD and spreadsheets.

Still inexact without refined determination of poles.



3. The Future: Despite lack of precision, Graphic Statics still is a method useful to bridge engineers and students.

Can develop elaborate spreadsheets to rate greater number of arch locations.

# Acknowledgements

- Dr. Dario Gasparini, CWRU
- Tom Edwards, Cleveland Public Library

